



DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF NIAGARA
Achieving Success Together

**THE MINUTES OF THE
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE
DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD OF NIAGARA**

BOARD ROOM - EDUCATION CENTRE
7:00 p.m. (Public Session)

JUNE 17, 2008

ATTENDANCE:

Board: Kevin Maves (Chair), Gary Atamanyk, Lora Campbell, Lynn Campbell, Dalton Clark, Gregg Dame, Liz Fulford, Marcy Heit, Larry Lemelin, Don Love (by teleconference), Barbara Ness

Regrets: Student Trustees Josh Dayboll and Emilia Ling

Officials: Warren Hoshizaki (Director of Education), Carol Germyn, Sue Greer, Cam Hathaway, Marilyn Hyatt, Linda Kartasinski, Jim Morgan, Jane Roth, John Stainsby, Ardeth Staz, Bob Crawford, Doug Durant, Brenda Stokes Verworn, Brett Sweeney, Kim Yielding, Karen Bellamy, Marian Lamb

Recording
Secretary: Irene Foster

Technical
Support: Linda Gonschior

A. CALL TO ORDER AND NOTING OF MEMBERS ABSENT

Kevin Maves, Chair, called the Special Meeting of the Board to order at 7:00 p.m.

B. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

No conflicts of interest were declared.

C. SINGING OF "O CANADA"

The Board stood and sang "O Canada" accompanied on tape by the West Park Secondary School Choir, St. Catharines, Ontario.

D. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

**Moved by Lynn Campbell
Seconded by Gregg Dame**

"That the Agenda be adopted."

CARRIED

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW

Staff Reports

Superintendent, Linda Kartasinski, brought two staff reports forward in response to requests for information at the June 10, 2008, Board meeting.

1. Secondary School Staffing

Superintendent, Jim Morgan, presented a report of Niagara District Secondary School's historical and projected staffing for the period 2004-2017. The report included information on the process for the secondary school staffing model. Superintendent Morgan explained that the first step is to determine the official projected enrolment (OPE), which provides the basis for all staff allocation calculations. The OPE is applied to the Ministry of Education's funding formula components to generate the required number of classroom teachers and guidance counsellors. The determined number of classroom teachers is a fixed factor in staffing and is allocated to schools using a component staffing model. The component staffing model takes into account a number of factors that generates a section allocation to schools. Superintendent Morgan explained that the Ministry of Education Foundation Grant is based upon the average daily enrolment (calculated from the October 31 and March 31 actual enrolment numbers). The Foundation Grant for the 2007-2008 school year was fixed at 57.76 teachers per one thousand students. Superintendent Morgan provided a summary of the historical and projected section allocations from 2004-2005 to 2017-2018 at Niagara District Secondary School based on the past and projected OPE. The cost of additional sections is calculated to be \$14,000 per section. Superintendent Morgan pointed out the importance of the number of classroom teachers and sections being fixed because the access to resources does not change. Superintendent Morgan summarized the impact of reallocating sections to Niagara District Secondary School from other high schools in the areas of depth/breadth of programming, class size, class caps, timetabling, combined classes, teachers teaching outside of their subjects and areas of certification, and sustainability.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Secondary School Staffing

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, stated the relevance of comparing the number of sections that Niagara District Secondary School borrows from the pool, with other schools. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, noted that Stamford Collegiate received an additional allocation of 15 sections; Eden High School, 11 sections; and Niagara District Secondary School, 10 sections. Eastdale Secondary School and Beamsville District Secondary School also received fewer additional sections. Welland Centennial Secondary School and Grimsby Secondary School did not borrow any sections from other schools.

Superintendent Morgan explained that Stamford Collegiate received an additional 9 sections due to an initial calculation error in the staffing matrix and that further sections were allocated to deal with class size issues. Eden High School was given an additional 11 sections due to an increase in enrolment and this is an historical practice during the staffing process. Niagara District Secondary School received an additional 10 sections in the 2007-2008 school year as a result of a request submitted by the school administration to address timetable conflicts and to assist with providing a depth and breadth of programs. Superintendent Morgan indicated that he had no detailed information with respect to the other schools at this time, however, a review of staffing notes indicates there were requests to deal with class caps in specific courses.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, asked for confirmation that the pool of staff generated in the staffing process is a finite number and that 57.76 applies to all schools with the exception that there may be a reallocation to deal with pressure areas. Trustee Fulford also asked if there is a limit to what can be borrowed. Superintendent Morgan confirmed that is essentially correct. The number of staff is a fixed number and the staffing process must ensure that the budget is maintained. Superintendent Morgan explained that the process provides for a few section holdbacks to deal with particular hot spots at the beginning of each semester, however, the staffing/section allocation is a finite number.

Trustee Fulford asked for confirmation that, with the exception of a small number of holdbacks, in order for a school to receive an additional allocation of sections, another school or schools must give up allocations. Superintendent Morgan replied that at the beginning of each semester there are a number of sections held back to deal with hot spots so that no school has to give up sections in those situations, however, the number of holdbacks are extremely limited, and are intended to deal with extreme fluctuations in enrolment.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, asked if every secondary school can borrow from the pool of sections to address students' subject requests. Superintendent Morgan replied that is correct.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Secondary School Staffing

Trustee, Don Love, noted that in the 2007-2008 school year Niagara District Secondary School had 256 timetable conflicts with 311 students. Trustee Love asked that, if it can be assumed that more conflicts can be expected for the 2008-2009 school year, does a reallocation of sections occur within each individual school between departments. Superintendent Morgan replied that currently the timetabling process is resolving conflicts for 2008-2009 and it is not a logical progression that a similar number of conflicts will occur based on a similar number of students. Superintendent Morgan added that more sophisticated software has been introduced to reduce the potential for timetable conflicts. Superintendent Morgan indicated that the allocation of sections within a school is done by the Principal at the initial timetabling stage and again in September with each department reviewing how sections can best be allocated within the department.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, commended Niagara District Secondary School, with the assistance of Rick Staz, for reducing the number of current timetable conflicts for September 2008.

Superintendent Morgan clarified for Trustee, Marcy Heit, that Niagara District Secondary School received an additional 10 sections in the 2007-2008 school year.

2. Capital Projects

Superintendent of Business, Jane Roth, indicated that staff were asked to provide a comparative summary of capital projects at secondary schools in Niagara-on-the-Lake, Niagara Falls, and St. Catharines from 1999-2000 to 2006-2007. Superintendent Roth explained that the report provides a summary of facility renewal projects and Good Places To Learn projects. Superintendent Roth noted that no Good Places To Learn projects were completed at Niagara District Secondary School in 2005, the year the Good Places to Learn initiative was introduced, as the Ministry of Education directed that Good Places To Learn funds be used in schools that will remain open for ten years. Given the 1999 recommendations regarding the school, funds were not directed to Niagara District Secondary School under the Good Places To Learn initiative. The report provides a list of facility renewal work completed at Niagara District Secondary School as well as a detailed summary of facility renewal projects and Good Places To Learn expenditures completed in other schools.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, stated that it appears projects completed at Niagara District Secondary School were quite similar in nature to other schools in terms of the types of repairs, with the exception of the Good Places To Learn projects, and that the amount of expenditures is similar to monies spent at St. Catharines Collegiate and Westlane Secondary School. Trustee Fulford stated that although the comparison is of St. Catharines and Niagara Falls schools, other

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Capital Projects

schools in the jurisdiction did not receive Good Places To Learn funding and Niagara District Secondary School was not an isolated situation within the Board. Doug Durant, Plant Services Controller, confirmed that there were schools that received prohibitive to repair funding, and, with the exception of Park Public School in Grimsby; facility repair grants only were allocated for work at Queen Mary Public School, Dalewood Public School, Memorial Public School, Edith Cavell Public School, and Lincoln Centennial Public School.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, clarified that she requested the comparison for St. Catharines and Niagara Falls only as they are areas where students from Niagara-on-the-Lake would choose to attend. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, indicated that she realizes the Good Places To Learn funding was not available to Niagara District Secondary School, however, capital expenditures in 2005 at Niagara District Secondary School total \$805,395, with all other schools receiving more, regardless of whether the expenditures were for facility renewal projects or Good Places to Learn projects. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, stated that one factor contributing to the low enrolment is that Niagara District Secondary School was not kept in a competitive state of repair. Trustee, Liz Fulford, pointed out that the amounts referenced by Trustee, Lynn Campbell, are a combined total of two different funding sources and, therefore, are not a valid comparison when some schools did not qualify for the Good Places to Learn funding. Comparing the total capital projects by adding the two expenditures is misleading. The appropriate comparison would be the expenditures for facility renewal projects only which shows that Niagara District Secondary School received as much or more than other schools that had a higher 2007-2008 enrolment. Trustee Fulford added that the allocation of the Good Places To Learn funding was for projects with specific parameters and did not reflect the state of repairs of a building and that several schools did not qualify for Good Places To Learn funding. Trustee, Barb Ness, pointed out that almost 50% of the schools on the list, including Niagara District Secondary School, received less than \$1 million for facility renewal projects in the same period. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, replied that she understands this, however, regardless of where the funds came from, more was spent on some schools than others. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, stated that what she hears in the community is that some students choose to attend schools other than Niagara District Secondary School because of the condition of the facility and the programming. Trustee, Marcy Heit, agreed that regardless of whether the funds are from facility renewal grants or Good Places To Learn funding, there is some flexibility in allocating funds to various projects, and the fact that Niagara District Secondary School is underfunded in that area is well known. Trustee Heit stated that in 1999 there were concerns about the viability of Niagara District Secondary School and whether the school could be maintained. Trustee Heit recalled that in the year following 1999 the enrolment surged, however, no one seems to be able to explain why the condition of the facility and the enrolment began to experience a decline over time after 1999.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW -

continued:

Chair, Kevin Moves, invited deliberations on the Niagara-on-the-Lake Accommodation Review.

**Moved by Gary Atamanyk
Seconded by Dalton Clark**

“That the Trustees concentrate on each issue separately so that discussion is distinct and that the Trustees deal with the secondary school issue first and then proceed with the elementary issues separately.”

CARRIED

Prior to putting the motion to a vote, Chair Maves invited discussion. Chair Maves clarified for Trustee, Lora Campbell that the intent of the motion is to deal with the issues regarding the high school first, and then discuss the elementary school recommendations.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, stated that each issue is separate and distinct and discussion will be different for each one. Trustee Atamanyk recommended that the Board decide on the secondary issue first and then proceed with each elementary school issue. Trustee Atamanyk clarified that secondary refers to Niagara District Secondary School and elementary refers to Parliament Oak Public School, St. Davids/Laura Secord Public Schools and Virgil/Colonel John Butler Public Schools.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, clarified his understanding that the motion recommends dealing with Niagara District Secondary School first then each elementary school named in the accommodation review.

Trustee, Don Love, stated that he is not in support of Trustee Atamanyk’s motion. The secondary and elementary issues are distinct and it would be easier to discuss the elementary issues first and then the secondary.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, stated that from an emotional perspective, deciding the secondary issue is the most difficult, however, it makes most sense in the decision-making process as the outcome of whether or not Niagara District Secondary School remains open will impact on the elementary school recommendations, particularly with respect to Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public Schools.

Chair Maves clarified for Trustee, Barb Ness, that Trustee Atamanyk’s reference to Laura Secord Public School and St. Davids Public School reflects the communities of Queenston and St. Davids.

Following discussion, Chair Maves put the motion to a vote, and the motion carried by a vote of 7-4.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW -

continued:

Chair Maves instructed the Trustees to begin deliberations on the high school.

**Moved by Gary Atamanyk
Seconded by Lynn Campbell**

“That Niagara District Secondary School remain open in September 2009 and that minor renovations of \$2 million be performed, on condition that, the actual Grade 9 student count is at least 100 students on October 31, 2008, or, that by January 31, 2009, the Town of Niagara-on-the-Lake has financially guaranteed full programming for ten (10) school years beginning in 2009-2010. This would be done by providing \$10,000 for each student less than 400 on October 31 of each school year. If this condition is not met, Niagara District Secondary School shall be closed on August 31, 2009.”

DEFEATED

No seconder having come forward, Brenda Stokes Verworn, Board Lawyer, reminded the Board that if there is no seconder then the motion dies on the table and another motion can be made. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, seconded the motion.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, called a point of order with respect to the order in which the motion will be spoken to.

Brenda Stokes Verworn, Board Lawyer, clarified that Rule 28 of the Board's Rules of Order states that, “a member may read a motion and after it is seconded, speak to it.”

Chair Maves stated that, prior to putting the motion to a vote, Trustee Atamanyk may speak to the motion first.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, explained that this is an effort to empower the community to determine the future of Niagara District Secondary School rather than solely the School Board. Trustee Atamanyk expressed his belief that education is a partnership and that we all share a responsibility to ensure our students are properly educated and that as partners we should all be contributing to problem solving. This option provides an opportunity for the community to demonstrate a willingness to work to keep Niagara District Secondary School open. The first condition in the motion is that there be 100 students taking classes in Grade 9 this September 2008. Trustee Atamanyk clarified some misunderstandings regarding busing. Trustee Atamanyk stated that busing is available free of cost to students from St. Catharines and Niagara Falls who choose to attend the Arts program at Niagara District Secondary School. Further, if students attend the Arts program in Grade 9 at Niagara District Secondary School, and they do not continue in the Arts program, they are still entitled to complete high school at Niagara District Secondary School, just as some Niagara-on-the-Lake students have chosen to attend alternate programs in St. Catharines or Niagara Falls. Therefore, having 100 Grade 9 students on October 31, 2008, increases the potential that those students will complete their high school education at Niagara District Secondary School and enable the school to remain viable with no discussion of another accommodation review in the near future. Trustee Atamanyk suggested that other special programs be established at Niagara District Secondary School to sustain enrolment, such as

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW -

continued:

promoting the high school as the first publicly funded high school in Ontario or Canada to be declared drug free. Trustee, Liz Fulford, expressed her support for the community and stated that it is not reasonable or appropriate and not within the Board's parameters to put this condition on the Town's budget. The School Board is only responsible for its own budget. Trustee Fulford added that the decision with respect to Niagara District Secondary School lies with this Board.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, explained that she seconded the motion because it was her hope there would actually be 100 students on October 31, 2008, making it unnecessary for fundraising and for the Town to allocate \$10,000 for each student. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, felt the motion shows the Board's commitment, with a view to renovate the school as soon as possible, and the community would do the same.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, stated that it is an interesting motion, however, he expressed his belief that the motion takes the decision-making responsibility away from this Board and sets the Town and the community up for failure. Trustee Clark referenced enrolment statistics previously provided and noted that in 2007 there are 408 Grades 5-8 students in all elementary schools in Niagara-on-the-Lake, and 99 of those students are in Grade 8. Therefore, if all Grade 8 students attend Niagara District Secondary School and do not choose to attend alternate programs such as the School to Work Program at Kernahan Park Secondary School, Extended French at Sir Winston Churchill, or Eden, the school is still one student short of the 100 students required in the motion. Trustee Clark reiterated that it is the Board's responsibility to the community and the students to offer a decent program. Trustee Clark added that future enrolment projections based on population cohort demographics indicate a further decline in enrolment from current statistics and, realistically, we know that not everyone will choose to attend Niagara District Secondary School. Trustee Clark commented that Niagara-on-the-Lake is similar to other communities with respect to declining enrolment except that Niagara-on-the-Lake's enrolment is declining faster mainly because of the demographics of the community. Trustee Clark stated that he will not vote in favour of the motion as it puts responsibility on the Town and the community to make the difficult decisions that Trustees are elected to make.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, expressed his support for the motion as it demonstrates the spirit of team effort and addresses the concept of partnering with all stakeholders to rebuild the school's image and respects the history of the school.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, expressed her appreciation for Trustee Clark's theory on enrolment statistics, noting that it is true the school's enrolment would benefit if students always attended their home school. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, expressed her confidence that a revitalized Arts and Athletic programs could attract students from St. Catharines and Niagara Falls. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, suggested there are limitless ideas and possibilities that could attract students and revitalize the school, such as a golf academy, hockey school, high skills agriculture program, and encourage attendance by international students, to create a school as envisioned by delegate Stephen Bedford.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW -

continued:

Trustee, Lora Campbell, expressed her support for keeping the high school open, however, she stated she does not agree with the condition in the motion that requires the residents of Niagara-on-the-Lake to allocate additional funding to the school from the municipal tax base.

Trustee, Marcy Heit, stated that enrolment numbers can change, however, future enrolment will not likely increase to the numbers hoped for.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk agreed with Trustee, Lynn Campbell, that students residing in St. Catharines and Niagara Falls are potentially Niagara District Secondary School students as well and that all three municipalities draw students from the same surrounding communities. Trustee Atamanyk expressed his belief that the residents of Niagara-on-the-Lake are the stakeholders most interested in what happens in the community and they are determined not to fail. Trustee Atamanyk expressed his confidence that the community's determination to reach the goal of 100 students on October 31, 2008, will be achieved and he does not anticipate that the condition of allocating \$10,000 will not have to be relied upon. Trustee Atamanyk agreed with Trustee, Lynn Campbell, that the Board should recruit international students to attend Niagara District Secondary School.

Trustee, Gregg Dame, expressed appreciation for the effort displayed by the motion, however, as creative as it is, Trustee Dame stated that he can not support the motion with two different timelines and two different conditions. Secondly, the Board should not consider setting a precedent for taxing individuals who are already taxed for education.

Trustee, Don Love, stated that he does not support the motion and, as expressed so well by Trustee Clark, the responsibility is on the Board to reach a decision without involving the Town.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, concluded by saying the motion is not meant to be a traditional approach to solving problems as traditional methods have not always worked. The intent of the motion is to empower stakeholders to consider new approaches to solve problems.

Chair Maves put the motion to a vote, and the motion was defeated by a vote of 8-3.

BOARD RECESS

The Board recessed from 8:10 - 8:15 p.m. Following the recess, Chair Maves cautioned the gallery to maintain decorum or be expelled from the meeting.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW -

continued:

Moved by Marcy Heit
Seconded by Lora Campbell

“WHEREAS Niagara District Secondary School is the only secondary school in Niagara-on-the-Lake;

AND WHEREAS the enrolment at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2008-2009 school year is projected to be below the 400 students required to provide a basic program, it does not generate sufficient staffing to offer a sufficiently broad range of compulsory and optional credits;

THEREFORE, the District School Board of Niagara recommends:

“That staff be authorized to immediately take the necessary steps to use up to \$2 million to renovate the Niagara District Secondary School site,

AND

That the District School Board of Niagara will immediately make a written request to the Ministry of Education seeking specific additional funding to maintain appropriate staffing to program a school of 400 students in order to keep the sole secondary school in Niagara-on-the-Lake open for instructional purposes with the expectation that the Ministry of Education must respond favourably with this funding by December 1, 2008,

AND

That as part of the revitalization of the Niagara District Secondary School site, the community will support reestablishing student enrolment with the understanding that if there is not at least 100 Grade 9 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2008, Ministry Report, in attendance at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2008-2009 school year, and, a combined total of least 200 Grades 9 and 10 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2009, Ministry Report, in attendance at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2009-2010 school year, then Niagara District Secondary School will be closed for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2010.”

DEFEATED

Prior to putting the motion to a vote, Chair Maves invited discussion.

Trustee, Lora Campbell, indicated that Lord Mayor Burrows has provided statistical information that is available on websites, and also provided a letter from the Niagara-on-the-Lake Town Council and the community which includes new options since the completion of the Accommodation Review Committee Report and Board Administration Report that include the campus concept, community centre, and alternative school. The Council and community are expressing a willingness to work together with the Board to

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

ensure the success of Niagara District Secondary School in Niagara-on-the-Lake. This commitment by the Town and the community supports a motion to keep the school open and improve enrolment at the school.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, called a point of order and asked who seconded the motion.

Chair Maves replied that Trustee, Lora Campbell, seconded the motion.

Trustee, Gregg Dame, indicated that he cannot support the motion with the condition regarding the number of students in attendance as it penalizes students who choose to attend alternative programs at other schools, such as the School To Work Program at Kernahan Park Secondary School, or Extended French at Sir Winston Churchill Secondary School. Trustee Dame recommended a friendly amendment to exclude reference to requisite student enrolment.

Trustee, Barb Ness, asked for clarification that, because the motion recommends taking the necessary steps to use up to \$2 million, there is a suggestion there is a pot of money somewhere. Trustee Heit replied that Doug Durant included that amount in a previous report as being required to make repairs to Niagara District Secondary School's parking lot, lockers, painting, and windows.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, expressed concerns about the number of Grade 9 intention sheets for September 2008 and another year may be required to reach 100 Grade 9 students. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, suggested that the motion be amended to read 100 students as indicated by the October 31, 2009, Ministry Report, not 2008.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, pointed out that the motion states that staff be authorized to immediately take the necessary steps to use up to \$2 million to renovate the Niagara District Secondary School site. Trustee Fulford stated that this money will be used to make improvements at the school and within two years the school could be closed if the numbers do not materialize. Trustee Fulford hoped the audience appreciates the creative efforts Trustees are making to keep the school open. Trustee Fulford pointed out the comments of Trustees Atamanyk and Heit that the community has shown a strong will to keep the school open. Trustee Fulford reminded the community that Niagara-on-the-Lake has four Trustees who represent St. Catharines and Niagara-on-the-Lake, not just one. Trustee Fulford added that we are all a part of a broader community and there are other municipalities within the jurisdiction that have only one high school. Trustee Fulford reminded the audience that the mill rate for education taxes is set by the province, and not at the local level. Trustee Fulford concluded by saying she cannot support the motion as written as it authorizes spending \$2 million on a building that could close in two years, and that does not represent a wise use of money in the short term.

Trustee Heit responded to Trustee Dame and Trustee, Lynn Campbell's, comments that question how many times must the community go through an accommodation review. Trustee Heit expressed confidence that if the momentum of the Town and the residents to reclaim their school can continue, the school can be viable in a short span. With respect to the use of up to \$2 million, Trustee Heit stated that improvements to the school demonstrates the Board's commitment to the community and students to support rebuilding and maintaining the school. Although the school will not likely see an

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

enrolment of 700 students, Niagara District Secondary School can be a good core school for the community. Trustee Heit expressed her concern that students in the senior grades are suffering and may continue to suffer. Trustee Heit reminded the community that Trustee determination is also based on population distribution and, if at amalgamation in 1998, Niagara-on-the-Lake retained a Trustee then, if up to \$2 million is spent on renovations in the next two years, this investment is necessary to give the school a fighting chance in a community that thinks they can do it, and eliminate the potential for accommodation reviews again and again.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, expressed his support for maintaining a high school in the community and stated that the recommended motions demonstrate the creative solutions being proposed to find a way to maintain a viable high school in Niagara-on-the-Lake. Trustee Lemelin stated that if raising friendly amendments as suggested by Trustees Dame and Lynn Campbell would provide an opportunity for the motion to go forward, then the amendments should be made.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, stated that this is a motion to close the school covered up with a lot of wording. The motion imposes conditions that represent further hurdles and responsibilities. Trustee Atamanyk stated that he is not confident the Ministry of Education will reply in a timely manner as set out in the motion. Trustee Atamanyk indicated that he cannot support the motion that, in his opinion, will close the school.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, acknowledged the residents of Niagara-on-the-Lake who care about their community and want to partner with the School Board. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, referenced a statement that was just handed to her that the Town of Niagara-on-the-Lake, together with local service groups, has raised a \$100,000 scholarship fund that will pay \$1,000 to each student entering Grade 9 and completing their secondary education at Niagara District Secondary School.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, stated that, like Trustee Atamanyk, he would like to support the motion that would keep the school open. However, the Board is relieved of its decision-making duty with this motion that puts the responsibility on the community and the Ministry of Education to meet certain conditions that will decide whether or not the school closes. Trustee Clark expressed his lack of confidence that the Ministry of Education will provide the requested additional funding, or respond favourably in a timely manner. Trustee Clark reminded the Board that requests have been made of the Ministry now for a number of years for \$5 million to address proven underfunding in Special Education, with no results. Trustee Clark expressed his concern that the conditions will unfairly put the community in turmoil this year, and again the following year when, likely, this is something that will not actually happen. The Ministry of Education has directed School Boards to maximize our facilities in a variety of ways. With respect to using up to \$2 million to renovate Niagara District Secondary School, Trustee Clark stated that the school is a nice building, not someplace you would be ashamed of. Trustee Clark noted that the St. Catharines Collegiate was in far worse condition before it was renovated than Niagara District Secondary School. Trustee Clark stated that he does not think brightening up the school will attract students from St. Catharines and Niagara Falls. Trustee Clark also pointed out that the community tried for years to sustain the school with an Arts program. Trustee Clark expressed his concern that asking students not to take advantage of programs in other areas and stay at Niagara District Secondary School is not a fair expectation and that a community

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

report that suggests closing the borders, not the school, denies students access to programs in other areas. Trustee Clark reminded Trustees that the Board's responsibility is to serve the best interests of all students in education, and not divide communities. Trustee Clark stated that students are well served but may be better served in a larger school. Trustee Clark reminded the community that their own expert identified that the right size for a secondary school is 1000 students, being much larger than any of our schools. We know we can deliver better education with a school population of 600-1000 students than in a school with a population of 300. Trustee Clark concluded by expressing his lack of confidence that, with this motion, the school has a chance of surviving past December 1, 2008.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, asked Doug Durant what types of repairs or updates could be done immediately for \$2 million that would attract students to the building. Trustee Fulford stated that repairing the parking lot, for example, will not provide a better education. Doug Durant replied that immediate repairs would be to the parking lot (\$150,000), roof replacement to be completed during the summer months (\$618,000), new locker faces, some new ceiling and lighting in visible areas, washroom updates, replacement windows in the Virgil wing, and painting throughout. Doug Durant added that none of these repairs address the major mechanical and electrical work identified in the facility section of the Accommodation Review Committee report. Approximately \$7 million in mechanical and electrical upgrades will be required at some point in the future. Doug Durant added that to complete the mechanical and electrical work, newly renovated ceilings would have to come down and although, that is not the typical way we update a school, the building could look better in the interim. Trustee Fulford questioned the types of things that could be done that would draw students and encourage them to stay. Trustee Fulford asked if the matter could be deferred for two years without requiring another review and without the Board being questioned on protocol. Brenda Stokes Verworn, Board Lawyer, replied that she is not aware of any barrier to having a motion with conditions and that allows for a reprieve, and that another review would not be required in that situation. Trustee Fulford agreed with Trustee Clark that it is not fair to the students and that it is difficult for the students who cannot compete with students who attend larger schools with more offerings. It is a challenge to address the real needs of students in a school with low enrolment.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, referenced an extensive study conducted by the Bill Gates Foundation that reviewed the kind and size of school that could offer the optimum program. The study indicated that the optimum size is a population of 500 and that a population of 1000 should be divided into two schools housed in the same building. Various studies show that there is conflicting evidence about the optimum school size, however, the Bill Gates Foundation study suggests that a school with 400-500 students would be appropriate. We know that an enrolment of 400 is required to offer a range of programs.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, noted that Doug Durant indicated that some repairs would be done immediately and additional repairs would be completed at a later date. Trustee Lemelin questioned how the projects could be coordinated so that there is minimal disturbance or duplication of work already completed. Trustee Lemelin agreed that getting funds from the Ministry of Education in this short timeframe would be a challenge. Trustee Lemelin suggested that if this motion does not fully represent what

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

is needed to resolve the issues, the Board could consider taking certain elements from this motion and recommending one the Board can go forward with.

Brenda Stokes Verworn reminded Trustees to be aware of the motion on the table. If an amendment is requested the majority must be in favour of modifying the existing motion. The amendment must be specific, and it must be seconded. Following debate, the amendment is put to a vote.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, indicated she was hoping for some feedback on the proposed \$1,000 scholarship as a cost saving factor that could be considered or incorporated into the motion. Chair Kevin reminded Trustees that an amendment would need a seconder as Brenda Stokes Verworn explained.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, asked if it was appropriate to request this amendment or motion. Brenda Stokes Verworn replied that more information the Board can take into consideration that may enable the community to meet the revitalization for student enrolment is beneficial, however, the Board has no control over whether or not the proposed scholarship will take place and it is not recommended that it be included in an amendment or motion.

**Amendment Moved by Lynn Campbell
Seconded by Larry Lemelin**

“That the motion to renovate and maintain Niagara District Secondary School as moved by Trustee Marcy Heit and seconded by Lora Campbell be amended to reflect extended dates that read at least 100 Grade 9 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2009, Ministry Report, for the 2009-2010 school year, and 200 Grades 9 and 10 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2010, Ministry Report, for the 2010-2011 school year, and a closing date of August 31, 2011.”

CARRIED

**Amendment Moved by Lynn Campbell
Seconded by Larry Lemelin**

“That the motion to renovate and maintain Niagara District Secondary School as moved by Trustee Marcy Heit and seconded by Trustee Lora Campbell be further amended by changing the date for a Ministry of Education response to December 1, 2009.”

CARRIED

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, read the original motion as amended.

“WHEREAS Niagara District Secondary School is the only secondary school in Niagara-on-the-Lake;

AND WHEREAS the enrolment at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2008-2009 school year is projected to be below the 400 students required to provide a basic program, it does not generate sufficient staffing to offer a sufficiently broad range of compulsory and optional credits;

THEREFORE, the District School Board of Niagara recommends:

“That staff be authorized to immediately take the necessary steps to use up to \$2 million to renovate the Niagara District Secondary School site,

AND

That the District School Board of Niagara will immediately make a written request to the Ministry of Education seeking specific additional funding to maintain appropriate staffing to program a school of 400 students in order to keep the sole secondary school in Niagara-on-the-Lake open for instructional purposes with the expectation that the Ministry of Education must respond favourably with this funding by December 1, 2009,

AND

That as part of the revitalization of the Niagara District Secondary School site, the community will support reestablishing student enrolment with the understanding that if there is not at least 100 Grade 9 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2009, Ministry Report, in attendance at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2009-2010 school year, and, a combined total of least 200 Grades 9 and 10 students, as indicated by the October 31, 2010, Ministry Report, in attendance at Niagara District Secondary School for the 2010-2011 school year, then Niagara District Secondary School will be closed for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2011.”

DEFEATED

Prior to putting the amended motion to a vote, Chair Maves opened the amended motion for debate.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, stated that the amended motion provides the Board and the community with realistic timelines to rebuild a great school.

Trustee, Don Love, pointed out the reality of the motion is that it will require the addition of costly staffing to 2011.

Chair Maves put the amended motion to a vote, and the motion was defeated by a vote of 8-3.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Discussion returned to the original motion on the table.

Trustee, Marcy Heit, responded to Trustee Clark's comments with respect to renovating the school. Trustee Heit stated that this is a proposed solution for the community to respond to. Niagara District Secondary School is a unique situation and with the community's support and input, it is hoped that the Ministry of Education would look favourably on a request for funding.

Trustee, Don Love, pointed out that the mover and seconder of the original motion have already spoken and asked if Trustees are being allowed to speak more than once. Chair Maves replied that an opportunity will be provided for additional, limited debate.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, asked if any further motions will be coming forward and, if so, can we include reference to providing free busing from St. Catharines and Niagara Falls through a more central point to make access to transportation to Niagara District Secondary School as easy as for transportation to Eden High School and Sir Winston Churchill Secondary School. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, added that she respects the students' choice to attend alternate programs, however, if Niagara District Secondary School closes, the students' choice to attend their home school is removed.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, indicated that she cannot support the motion as written as it is misleading to the audience that the Ministry of Education will respond favourably to a request to allocate funds to program a school of 400 students when the projected enrolment for the 2008-2009 school year is well below 400.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, stated that it is important to consider this motion and if it is not appropriate a friendly amendment can be suggested to remove reference to the 400 students with respect to the requested funding and build from there.

Chair Maves called a point of order and reminded Trustee Lemelin that an amendment would require a mover and a seconder.

Trustee Heit stated that the suggested amendment misconstrues the intent of her motion.

Chair, Kevin Maves, expressed his support for including a request for additional funding from the Ministry of Education noting that this is a unique situation because Niagara-on-the-Lake is the only high school in the community and it is hoped the Ministry of Education would support the only high school in the community. The recommendation also asks the community to make a commitment by increasing enrolment.

Chair Maves put the original motion to a vote, and the motion was defeated by a vote of 7-4.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Chair Maves opened the floor to further discussion.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, pointed out that reports on population growth in Niagara-on-the-Lake show that over the past three decades population has grown by 2000-2500 residents and enrolment has declined from 900 students to the point we are today. Trustee Fulford noted that this is not the first time this school has been in this position and then, as now, the community has rallied in support of maintaining Niagara District Secondary School. Discussion has also included the choice of attending alternate programs and these program decisions are made by each parent and student based on a variety of reasons and what is best for their own family. Trustee Fulford stated that over time support from community has not been evident, based on enrolment.

**Moved by Liz Fulford
Seconded by Barb Ness**

“The Niagara District Secondary School be closed for instructional purposes effective June 30, 2009.”

DEFEATED

Prior to putting the motion to a vote, Chair Maves invited discussion.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, stated that he cannot grasp the concept of not having a high school in Niagara-on-the-Lake. Trustee Lemelin asked how the Board can find a way to blend all of these options to begin the rebuilding of the school and invited the Trustees to continue working together to propose a concept that can be developed and coordinated into a motion.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, explained that when she was elected to represent Niagara-on-the-Lake as a Trustee, her original goal, in addition to trying to be a good Trustee, was to work towards the building of a new high school in Niagara-on-the-Lake. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, stated that she finds herself in a position of requesting that things be done that should have been done years ago. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, beseeched the Trustees to consider their decision as if this was their high school in their home town.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, expressed his opposition to closing Niagara District Secondary School, saying that the school should exist and can go on, however, this forum is not creating that idea favourably. Trustee Atamanyk stated that Niagara District Secondary School should be allowed to stay open as long as the community demonstrates the will to make the school viable in such ways that it can be maintained. Trustee Atamanyk encouraged the community, that if the motion to close carries, to continue to work towards keeping the school open.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, pointed out that the staffing forecast presented earlier by Superintendent Morgan shows that the Board will be subsidizing additional sections in order to bring sections up to the 400 enrolment level by paying \$680,000 - \$800,000 over the next few years that must be reallocated from monies that support students in other classrooms. Trustee Fulford indicated she does not want to close the school, but has concerns with issues that students who choose to stay at Niagara District Secondary School will face. Trustee Fulford stated that the current enrolment does not

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

demonstrate the community's will to maintain a viable enrolment. Similar situations were faced at other schools. Merritton residents, for example, viewed Merritton as a separate community from St. Catharines and they expressed a desire to keep Merritton High

School open. However, enrolment continued to decline when students chose to attend program at other schools. A vote to keep Niagara District Secondary School open will result in the reallocation of larger subsidies from other schools.

Trustee, Don Love, expressed his great interest in Special Education and his concern that the underfunding of \$5 million compounded by providing additional staff to Niagara District Secondary School, is not acceptable. Trustee Love stated that sufficient enrolment is required to offer appropriate programs, and he will support the closure of Niagara District Secondary School effective June 30, 2009.

Trustee, Barb Ness, stated that the most difficult decision for Trustees is to close a school whether it is the only school in the community or one of ten in a community. Trustee Ness indicated that since the Ministry of Education has lifted the moratorium on enrolment reviews, this process will happen in many communities in our region. A difficult decision will have to be made tonight and more nights to come. The Board must focus on providing the best opportunities for all of our students.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, responded to Trustee Fulford's comments by saying that although a reallocation of additional subsidies will be required from other schools, the Report on Capital Projects shows that so little has been spent at Niagara District Secondary School over the years, and the reallocation of subsidies seems minimal compared to all the taxes paid by the residents of Niagara-on-the-Lake.

Chair Maves put the motion to a vote, and the motion was defeated by a vote of 6-5.

Chair Maves stated that the debate and discussion shows that there is a will to keep the high school open, however, the matter still needs to be resolved. Chair Maves called for comments from the floor.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, expressed a willingness to reconsider Trustee Heit's motion to renovate the school and maintain it under the conditions outlined.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, called a point of order that a motion previously dealt with cannot be dealt with at the same meeting.

Brenda Stokes Verworn, Board Lawyer, confirmed that Rule 42 of the Board's By-Laws states that after a vote has been taken on any question, such vote may be reconsidered at the same meeting with the consent of two-thirds majority of the members present.

In response to Trustee Fulford's question, Superintendent Kartasinski replied that 46 Grade 9 intention sheets have been submitted for the 2008-2009 school year.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, stated that if the community is confident that it can increase the enrolment over time, but the condition of having at least 100 Grade 9 students by the October 31, 2008, Ministry Report is not realistic, then consideration should be given to amending the required enrolment to reflect a percentage of growth that reaches 100 over the next four years. Failing to meet that target, Trustee Fulford indicated she

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

hoped Trustees will reconsider the decision to keep the school open. Trustee Fulford stated that she does not want to close the school, however, the expectation of a reasonable percentage increase in growth will demonstrate commitment by the Board and require community support as well.

BOARD RECESS

The Board recessed from 9:30 - 9:50 p.m.

Moved by Liz Fulford

Seconded by Lora Campbell

“That Niagara District Secondary School remain open for the upcoming school year 2008-2009. If the school’s average daily enrolment does not reach 350 students as indicated by the October 31, 2009, Ministry Report, then Niagara District Secondary School will close for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2010.”

CARRIED

Prior to putting the motion to a vote, Chair Maves invited discussion.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, explained that the intent of the motion is to recognize and acknowledge that the community has demonstrated strong support for the school and has expressed confidence that the students will attend. The condition is expressed in terms of a total enrolment of 350 students, and not by specific grades, thereby providing the community with a realistic opportunity to increase enrolment with students currently attending other schools. Increased enrolment will result in more sections that do not have to be subsidized from other schools. With the community’s support, the motion represents a good investment in the community and a wise allocation of tax dollars that the Ministry of Education entrusted the Board to spend wisely. Trustee Fulford expressed her confidence that enrolment can grow to 350 within the specified timeframe. This motion provides the community with the opportunity to do that and, if carried, puts a firm end to this Accommodation Review.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, indicated he will not support the motion as it is a motion to close the school if the community cannot meet the burden and challenge of increasing the average daily enrolment to 350 by October 31, 2009.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, stated that this is the second motion that has a stipulation of closing and the previous motion that carried was a vote that the school would not close. Trustee Lemelin suggested that Trustees build on the motion that carried with further discussion at a later date on the secondary issue. Trustee Lemelin suggested that the Board now discuss the elementary school issues.

Chair Maves reminded Trustee Lemelin that the Board is bound by its motion to deal with the secondary issue first.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, expressed her belief that the secondary issue was decided when the previous motion was carried and that discussion now should focus on developing a good business plan. There is no need to entertain any further motions regarding the high school and discussion should move on to the elementary issues.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, agreed with Trustee, Lynn Campbell, that the Board has already voted against closing the school and he added that this is another motion to close Niagara District Secondary School.

Trustee, Don Love, pointed out that the motion to close Niagara District Secondary School was clearly lost by a vote of 6-5, the school should remain open, and the Board should not be entertaining another motion.

Trustee, Barb Ness, reminded the Board that the previous motion had a timeline and that is what was defeated and that does not mean there can be no further discussion about the high school.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, agreed that the Board's vote against the motion does not mean another motion cannot come forward. The community has expressed confidence that the enrolment can increase and make the school viable. Trustee Clark stated that this motion provides the community with that opportunity, is in order, and he would support it.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, stated that there can be agreement to disagree and although this motion is redundant, there can still be discussions to deal with Administration recommendations and to resolve conflicts at another meeting in the fall.

Trustee, Barb Ness, spoke to the motion, stating that the motion keeps the school open and provides the community with the opportunity to do what they have been asking the Board to let them do, that is, bring students into the school.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, indicated that this is a new motion and it should not have been circulated to the Trustees before it was read and is, therefore, not valid. Trustee Lemelin questioned the legality of the motion given Brenda Stokes Verworn's comment to Marian Lamb that the motion should be read before it is distributed.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, reminded Trustees that they are routinely provided with written motions in their Board packages and have the weekend prior to the Board meeting to review them.

Brenda Stokes Verworn advised that the motion was distributed following the break as a courtesy and the motion is not illegal because it was circulated prior to being read.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, responded to Trustee Ness's comments that Niagara-on-the-Lake can demonstrate support by trying to increase the enrolment, however, the Board must demonstrate commitment to the community as well, including by making improvements to the school.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee, Don Love, stated that the previous motion to close the school was clearly defeated by a vote of 6-5 and it is redundant to even discuss this issue and pursue it as is being suggested.

Trustee, Dalton Clark, clarified that this current motion, if passed, guarantees that Niagara District Secondary School will remain open from 2008-2010.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, reiterated that the intent of the motion is not to close Niagara District Secondary School or to put a cloud over Niagara District Secondary School, and that reference to the school remaining open for the 2008-2009 school year was stated as a preamble. Trustee Fulford indicated that, given the forecasted enrolment of 257 students for September 2008, and the projected decline in enrolment over the next ten years, the motion is intended to provide the Board and the community with an opportunity to draw the number of students into the school that are necessary to run a viable program, perhaps not the widest and deepest, but sufficient to sustain enough sections for 350 students. The motion provides the Board and the community with a realistic goal and reflects the will that is in the community to make the school a success. Trustee Fulford pointed out that the task of sustaining a viable school will only get more difficult and it requires the support of the School Board, parents, and the community to put bodies in the school in order to provide programs and to ensure a successful future.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, called a point of order and asked for a ruling if the motion is in order.

After conferring with Brenda Stokes Verworn and the Director, Chair Maves stated that there have been four separate motions and each referenced a date of closure. Chair Maves ruled that the motion is valid and can be voted on.

Chair Maves read the motion, and put the motion to a vote. The motion carried by a vote of 6-5 in favour.

Chair Maves affirmed that Niagara District Secondary School will remain open. Chair Maves added that passing the motion does not preclude the Board from negotiating and having discussions with the Town and the community to increase enrolment at the school.

The secondary issue having been decided, Chair Maves invited discussion on the elementary issues.

ELEMENTARY SCHOOL ISSUES

Trustee, Dalton Clark, indicated that he can support the recommendations in the Board Administration Report with the exception that the Board look for a new larger site in the Virgil building area to accommodate the students from both Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public Schools. Trustee Clark questioned whether the existing Virgil Public School site is large enough to provide sufficient area for a new school and playspace to accommodate the students from both schools.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, questioned why the Board would look for land when we own 29 acres at Niagara District Secondary School.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee Clark explained that Niagara District Secondary School is very close to the Old Town and building a new school on that site would make it difficult to maintain the boundaries for the school presently in the Old Town. Students residing in Garrison Village would only live 2 km away from the Niagara District Secondary School site and it would be difficult to justify keeping Parliament Oak Public School open. The community has expressed their desire to keep Parliament Oak Public School open and maintain a presence in the Old Town. Generally, the community is in support of closing Laura

Secord Public School and moving the students to St. Davids Public School. The community has also expressed a concern about the size of the Virgil site but would like to have the new school as close to the urban area of Virgil as possible. The Virgil Public School community indicated their willingness to move to the Niagara District Secondary School site if that would keep Niagara District Secondary School open, however, the two issues are not related as the location of the new elementary school does not affect the high school population.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, agreed that the Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public School sites are small and they are not the size we would purchase to build a new school. Trustee Fulford agreed that if we are building a new school, then the Board should provide a larger property in the 7 acre range to ensure adequate playspace and square footage. Trustee Fulford added that it is a well known fact that problems develop when a school is too crowded.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, agreed that a larger site is needed to ensure adequate playspace, and questioned if any preliminary investigation into alternate sites and costs has been conducted.

Director, Warren Hoshizaki, indicated that no specific sites have been considered, however, if directed by the Board, staff could do that and bring information to the Board at a later date.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, stated that he has visited the Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public School sites and saw plenty of space at Colonel John Butler Public School. Trustee Atamanyk indicated that he has heard previous suggestions to move Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public Schools to the Niagara District Secondary School site because there is available space to build a new school and provide more playspace and a larger parking lot. Trustee Atamanyk added that he has also heard that what happens in the classroom is most important to a student's education. Trustee Atamanyk questioned how a larger parking lot helps students learn and how a new daycare would help students learn. Trustee Atamanyk added that building a new school on the Niagara District Secondary School will result in all students being bused, instead of some. Trustee Atamanyk encouraged Trustees to make a wise decision based on logic, sound reasoning, and solid evidence and to resist the temptation of strong advertising and the clamouring crowd.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

**Moved by Gregg Dame
Seconded by Liz Fulford**

“That staff be directed to acquire an appropriate sized building site within the urban development area of Virgil for the construction of a new elementary school to accommodate the students from Colonel John Butler and Virgil Public Schools.”

Prior to putting the motion to a vote, Chair Maves invited discussion.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, questioned the direction to acquire a site as opposed to investigate a site.

Director, Warren Hoshizaki, replied that staff will be required to bring that information forward to Trustees in-camera.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, expressed his concern about the financial impact of allocating monies to purchase property. Trustee Lemelin questioned why the Board would consider purchasing property when the Town has indicated a willingness to partner with the Board and also locate a new community centre. Trustee Lemelin indicated his support for building a new elementary school on the Niagara District Secondary School site.

Trustee Dame pointed out that the community has spoken quite loudly that they want a community school. Suggestions have been made that all three elementary schools be located on the Niagara District Secondary School site and the intent of the motion is to maintain a school within the community of Virgil.

Trustee, Larry Lemelin, replied to Trustee Dame that the comments he has received are not reflective of all the people in Virgil and Niagara-on-the-Lake and a community concept could be achieved if Grades 7 and 8 students were moved into the high school.

Trustee, Gary Atamanyk, expressed his support for the motion as it reflects the desire and needs of the community. Trustee Atamanyk added that he has not heard any firm commitment that a community centre will be located on the Niagara District Secondary School site.

Trustee, Marcy Heit, stated that she cannot support the purchase of additional property and that the Niagara District Secondary School site would work well for the elementary schools. The Accommodation Review process reviewed the number of schools and enrolment and the greatest support from the community was for a new school on the Colonel John Butler School site, however, the community would support a school on the Niagara District Secondary School site if it kept the high school open.

Trustee, Liz Fulford, expressed support for the motion to ensure the new school is built on a separate property to meet the current and future needs of the community. Trustee Fulford suggested that if the Niagara District Secondary School site is too large, a portion of it can be sold.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee Heit questioned the rationale not to locate Grades 7 and 8 students at the 25 acre Niagara District Secondary School site when the Board passed a motion to relocate the Grades 7 and 8 Queen Mary Public School students in the St. Catharines Collegiate.

Trustee, Barb Ness, expressed her support for ensuring three separate community elementary schools in Niagara-on-the-Lake. Trustee Ness indicated she would consider reviewing site options, but her preference is to locate the new Virgil/Colonel John Butler Public School on the existing Virgil Public School site.

Trustee Lemelin expressed his concern that students not experience transition interruptions during construction of the new elementary school.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, indicated she would support the motion if it read “investigate” and not “acquire.”

**Amended Motion Moved by Gregg Dame
Seconded by Liz Fulford**

“That staff be directed to investigate the acquisition of an appropriate sized building site within the urban development area of Virgil for the construction of a new elementary school to accommodate the students from Colonel John Butler and Virgil Public Schools.”

CARRIED

Director, Warren Hoshizaki, noted a point of clarification that a motion is still required with respect to St. Davids and Laura Secord Public Schools.

Trustee, Don Love, indicated that he is prepared to support to investigate the acquisition of property in the Virgil area, however, a new elementary school constructed on the Niagara District Secondary School property would be a separate structure and demonstrates support for the high school.

Trustee Ness asked for clarification that if the motion passes does that mean there will be an elementary school in Virgil. Director Hoshizaki replied that staff will only investigate the acquisition of a site and the Board must still pass a motion regarding the elementary schools.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, asked if the option of building a new school on the Niagara District Secondary School site is still open.

Trustee, Don Love, replied that there are three proposed and distinct elementary schools, the newly constructed Virgil/Colonel John Butler Public School, Parliament Oak Public School, and Laura Secord/St. Davids with the appropriate renovations. If the Board follows the ARC recommendation regarding the feasibility of the Virgil and Colonel John Butler Public Schools, then a new elementary school must be constructed to accommodate both schools prior to closing the other two. Trustee Love stated that it makes sense to house the students where they are until the Board decides on a location and builds the new school.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Trustee Clark agreed that the Accommodation Review Committee and the Board Administration came up with the same recommendations regarding the elementary schools. If passed, this motion would support the ARC reports.

Chair Maves put the amended motion to a vote, and the amended motion carried 8-3.

Laura Secord / St Davids Public Schools

**Moved by Dalton Clark
Seconded by Barb Ness**

“That Laura Secord Public School Public School be officially closed for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2009, and that the Laura Secord Public School Public School JK-3 student population be accommodated at St. Davids Public School by constructing an addition at the St. David’s Public School site.”

Trustee, Lora Campbell, asked about the inclusion of a daycare facility. Trustee Clark replied that it has been the practice of the Board to include a daycare facility at newly constructed sites.

**Amended Motion Moved by Dalton Clark
Seconded by Barb Ness**

“That Laura Secord Public School Public School be officially closed for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2009, and that the Laura Secord Public School Public School JK-3 student population be accommodated at St. Davids Public School by constructing an addition at the St. David’s Public School site that would include a daycare.”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, recalled that all of the elementary school recommendations include a daycare centre, however, the population cannot support that number of daycare facilities. Trustee, Lynn Campbell, suggested that there be a separate motion to investigate the location and feasibility of a daycare.

Trustee, Marcy Heit, asked if the Board is funded for the construction of daycare facilities when we construct them.

Superintendent, Jane Roth, replied that the Board does not receive separate funding to construct daycare facilities and those monies would come from reserves.

Trustee, Lynn Campbell, asked how the daycare facility constructed at Nelles Public School in Grimsby was funded.

E. DELIBERATIONS ON NIAGARA-ON-THE-LAKE ACCOMMODATION REVIEW - continued:

Doug Durant, Plant Services Controller, replied that the daycare facilities constructed at Nelles and Grand Avenue Public Schools in Grimsby were special circumstances that received federal and provincial capital funding through the Regional Municipality of Niagara under the Best Start Initiative. The School Board has entered into long term agreements with the Region and daycare service providers to recoup some of the monies.

Chair Maves put the motion to a vote, and the motion carried unanimously.

Colonel John Butler / Virgil Public Schools

Moved by Dalton Clark

Seconded by Lynn Campbell

“That both Colonel John Butler Public School and Virgil Public School be officially closed for instructional purposes effective August 31, 2010, or earlier if the replacement new school is ready for occupancy.”

AND

“That a new elementary school for Grades JK-8 be constructed on a site to be approved by the Board to accommodate the students from Colonel John Butler and Virgil Public Schools for a scheduled new school opening in September 2010.”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Chair Maves put the motion to a vote, and the motion carried unanimously.

Chair, Kevin Maves, confirmed that Parliament Oak Public School will remain open as a neighbourhood school in the Old Town.

F. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Liz Fulford
Seconded by Marcy Heit

“That this meeting of the District School Board of Niagara be now adjourned.”

CARRIED

The meeting adjourned at 10:50 p.m.

KEVIN MAVES
Chair

WARREN HOSHIZAKI
Director of Education and Secretary